

Report

12

Report to:	Corporate Resources Committee
Date of Meeting:	10 December 2008
Report by:	Executive Director (Corporate Resources)

Subject:	Equal Pay Review
----------	-------------------------

1. Purpose of Report

1.1. The purpose of the report is to:-

- ◆ advise the Committee of the results of the Council's second equal pay review

2. Recommendation(s)

2.1. The Committee is asked to approve the following recommendation(s):-

- (1) that the findings of the equal pay review be noted.

3. Background

- 3.1. It was agreed in 2004 that Personnel Services in conjunction with Resource Personnel sections and Internal Audit would undertake an equal pay review, following the implementation of single status and roll out of the Competence Initiative and Job Evaluation Schemes across the Council.
- 3.2. The review also provided the opportunity to investigate whether barriers to career progression exist for female employees and identify areas of occupational segregation. A joint working group consisting of personnel managers and representatives of the trade unions was set up to review the findings and make recommendations.
- 3.3. In December 2006, the results of the review and a positive action plan were reported to the Corporate Resources Committee and the approval to launch the "Delivering a Fairer Future" positive action programme was given. Delivering a Fairer Future was launched in February 2007 and was subsequently included in the Council's Gender Equality Scheme published in June 2007.
- 3.4. The equal pay review was undertaken in 3 "streams" in line with equal pay review guidance issued by the former Equal Opportunities Commission which is now the Equalities and Human Rights Commission (EHRC):-
- ◆ Stream 1 – Analysis of gender balance at middle/senior management level
 - ◆ Stream 2 – Analysis of gender balance by Service and pay grade
 - ◆ Stream 3 – Analysis within pay grades/significant pay gaps

3.5. The overall analysis in 2005/06 showed that:-

- ◆ females made up 67 % of the workforce
- ◆ 84% of employees in the lowest grade band were female
- ◆ only 35% female representation in the top grade band. The remaining three bands were around the EHRC figure of 51% female workforce

3.6. The initial review provided a statistical benchmark to gauge the effectiveness of positive action measures. In October 2008, Personnel Services undertook a second equal pay review to examine the current make-up of the workforce and to monitor the application of the Competence Initiative and Job Evaluation Schemes.

4. The analysis

4.1. The second review followed the same methodology as the first review as outlined in 3.4. An added element to this review was the inclusion of the statistical breakdown of employees who work part-time.

4.2. Council-wide analysis

4.2.1. The overall analysis of the Council's workforce as of October 2008 shows that the breakdown is 67% female and 33% male. Females represent 80% of the bottom grade band and 40% of the top grade band. The statistics are attached as Appendix A.

4.2.2. Of the 5,517 females employed in Grade 1, 83% hold part-time positions. The findings of this analysis are consistent with the Women and Work Commission 2006 Report and the Gender Audit of Statistics commissioned by the Scottish Executive in 2007, where it was found that women are more likely than men to work part-time and to use flexible working arrangements. The Gender Audit also reported that women predominate in key public sector workforces and in lower occupational grades.

4.2.3. The following table provides an overview of the Council's workforce as of October 2008.

	Overall Makeup of Workforce Local Government Employees			Full-time/Part-time breakdown within grade band			
	Number			Male		Female	
Grade	Employees	Male	Female	P/T	F/T	P/T	F/T
1	6930	20%	80%	25%	75%	83%	17%
2	3583	45%	55%	4%	96%	39%	61%
3	1848	48%	52%	4%	96%	25%	75%
4	258	60%	40%	1%	99%	10%	90%
5	154	61%	39%	0%	100%	3%	97%
6+	35	60%	40%	0%	100%	0%	100%
Overall	12808	33%	67%	11%	89%	65%	35%

4.2.4. In reviewing the figures there is an expectation that the percentage of females in each grade band at least reflects the EHRC target of 51% or is proportionate to female representation in the Council. In Grades 2 through 6, the number of females is disproportionate to the Council figure of 67%.

4.2.5 A comparison to the first review shows that there has been a decrease in female representation in Grade 1 from 84% in the first review to 80%. An increase in female representation can be reported for Grade 2 (+6% from 49%), Grade 3 remained the same, Grade 4 (+3% from 37%). In 2006, it was reported that there were 62 females in the top pay band and there are now 74 females which represents an increase of 19%. It is evident from these statistics that, whilst the EHRC target has not been met, improvement has been made and females are progressing through the grades.

4.3. **Stream 1 – Analysis of gender balance at middle / senior management level**

4.3.1. The analysis of middle/senior management (Grades 4 to 6) revealed that females represent 40% (Grade 4), 39% (Grade 5) and 40% (Grade 6). These figures are disproportionate to the female workforce as a whole and below the EHRC target of 51% which was used as the initial benchmark.

4.3.2. The number of females in middle and senior management who work part-time is significantly lower than the rest of the workforce. Only 10% of females in Grade 4, 3% in Grade 5 and 0% in Grade 6 work part time. This trend is reflected in all Resources and mirrors the findings of the Women and Work Commission which states that women in management positions tend to work full time hours. Caring responsibilities and a perceived expectation to work long hours were highlighted by the Commission as barriers to career progression.

4.4. **Stream 2: analysis of gender balance by Service and pay grade**

4.4.1. The statistical analysis of the workforce by Resource and Service areas revealed that Community, Education and Social Work remain predominately female representing 55%, 90%, and 86% of the workforce respectively. Enterprise and Housing and Technical Resources remain predominately male. Once again this mirrors the research findings of EHRC and the Women and Work Commission which states that males and females seek employment in what are considered traditional roles.

4.4.2. Community Resources employs 2058 females; 1776 (65%) of whom are in Grade 1 and 91% of those are employed on a part-time basis. These part-time employees are mainly in Facilities Management, Cultural Services and Support Services. Community Resources employs 1700 males and the majority are in Grounds Maintenance, Facilities Management and Cleansing and Refuse. Males in Grade 1 who work part-time are mainly in Facilities Management and Cultural Services with 57% and 79% of the grade respectively.

4.4.3. Social Work Resources employs 2517 females, the majority (99%) of whom are concentrated in the bottom 3 grade bands. Older People's Services employs 58% of the female workforce (1459) and they represent 94%, 92% and 82% of Grades 1 to 3 respectively. The highest proportion (90%) of women are part-time employees located in Grade 1.

4.4.4. Enterprise Resources is still predominately male, however, there has been a slight increase in female representation. Of the 712 employees, 215 (30%) are female; 87% are concentrated in Grades 1 to 3. The majority of females are located in Estates and Support, however, it is noted that there is 30% representation in Planning with 62% (23 females) holding positions in Grade 3. Of those females, 22% work part-time.

4.4.5. Housing and Technical Resources has increased to 49% female from 43% at the time of the last review. Housing and Technical Resources employs 1050 females;

634 (77%) in Area Services, 166 (16%) in Property Services and 250 (83%) in Support Services. The female workforce is concentrated in Grades 1 to 3 (99%) and mainly in Area and Support Services.

4.5. Stream 3: analysis within pay grades/significant pay gaps

4.5.1. The Council's pay structure operates on the basis of grade bands. Placement within the grade depends on an employee's personal competence which is assessed through the Performance and Development Review.

4.5.2. The analysis of pay details was undertaken to ensure that the Competence Initiative and Job Evaluation Schemes have been applied fairly and consistently across the organisation.

4.5.3. Reports generated from the Council's management system (HRMS) which contained all pay details for employees were sorted by job title and the following was examined:-

- ◆ rate of progression
- ◆ access to additional pay
- ◆ application of increments for shift working

4.5.4. As a result, 115 issues were highlighted and issued to Resource Personnel Managers for further investigation. Resources have been asked to report their findings to Personnel Services and advise what action will be taken to resolve issues.

5. Conclusions

5.1. The first equal pay review conducted in 2005/2006 showed evidence of occupational segregation within the workforce and a positive action programme was developed to address this through recruitment initiatives; monitoring performance and development reviews; and promotion of work-life balance policies.

5.2. This second analysis of the gender balance has revealed that there has been little change in the statistics with regard to horizontal occupational segregation. The Council's workforce is segregated into those roles which are considered to be traditionally female or male. Community, Education and Social Work are predominately female, whereas Enterprise and Housing and Technical Resources are predominately male. A culture change is needed in order to challenge assumptions about the types of jobs males and females can do; a difficult goal to achieve. Positive action measures undertaken in the past year to affect change have included:-

- ◆ providing a developmental opportunity for females by establishing an all female squad of Land Service Operatives
- ◆ offering individuals the opportunity to sign up for the positive action programme and try taster days in non traditional roles
- ◆ promotional articles featuring females employed in non traditional roles
- ◆ advertising vacancies considered to be under-represented in one gender under the 'Delivering a Fairer Future' badge and encouraging applications from the targeted gender
- ◆ ensuring the member of the targeted gender is guaranteed an interview if they meet the basic criteria of the role
- ◆ recruiting unskilled Roads Operatives to allow females access to the role

5.3. While the overall makeup of the workforce has remained at 67% female and 33% male, there has been a 4% increase in the number of males employed in the lower pay band which is consistent with the labour turnover rate of 4%. The statistics also show that females have progressed through the grades but that the representation of females in each grade does not meet the expected targets. Positive action measures that have been undertaken to address this include:-

- ◆ monitoring Performance and Development Review completion
- ◆ those who signed up for Delivering a Fairer Future were able to arrange career development discussions with employee development personnel
- ◆ promotion of Learning Resource Centres
- ◆ promotion of Corporate courses such as “Springboard” or “How to get that job”
- ◆ additional spaces were reserved for females on the Management Development Programme and the Council continues to develop employees through the Practical Supervision and Front-line Managers Programmes

5.4. In addition to positive action measures to ensure there are no barriers to career progression, the Council continues to be at the forefront of good practice to ensure fairness and consistency in its recruitment and selection policies.

6. Employee Implications

6.1. None

7. Financial Implications

7.1. Any adjustments required to employees' grades will be funded from existing budgetary resources.

8. Equality Impact Assessment and Consultation Arrangements

8.1. This report does not introduce a new policy, function or strategy or recommend a change to an existing policy, function or strategy and, therefore, no impact assessment is required.

8.2. Consultation has been undertaken with the Trade Unions.

Robert McIlwain

Executive Director (Corporate Resources)

19 November 2008

Link(s) to Council Objectives

- Excellent Employer
- Accountable, Effective, and Efficient

Previous References

13 December 2006

List of Background Papers

- Report to Corporate Resources Committee 13 December 2006
- Women and Work Commission Report February 2006
- Government Action Plan “Implementing the Women and Work Commission recommendations” (2006)
- A Gender Audit of Statistics: Comparing the Position of Women and Men in Scotland (2007)

Contact for Further Information

If you would like to inspect the background papers or want further information, please contact:-

Sheila McKenzie, Personnel Officer

Ext: 5024 (Tel: 01698 45 5024)

E-mail: sheila.mckenzie@southlanarkshire.gov.uk