


| | | |
|---|-----------------|--------------------------------------|
|  | <h1>Report</h1> | Agenda Item <h2>8</h2> |
|---|-----------------|--------------------------------------|

Report to: **Planning Committee**
 Date of Meeting: **12 July 2005**
 Report by: **Executive Director (Enterprise Resources)**

Application No CR/04/0114
 Planning Proposal: Erection of Extension and Conversion of Nursing Home to Form 8 Flats, Erection of 9 Detached Dwellinghouses, Formation of Parking and Associated Alterations (Listed Building Consent)

1 Summary Application Information

- Application Type : Listed Building Application
- Applicant : Balvaird Homes Ltd
- Location : Cathkin House
Rutherglen

2 Recommendation(s)

2.1 The Committee is asked to approve the following recommendation(s):-

- (1) Grant Listed Building Consent
(Subject to Conditions – Based on Conditions Listed)

2.2 Other Actions/Notes

- (1) The Committee has the delegated powers to determine this application.
 (2) This application relates to a Category B Listed Building and will have to be referred to Historic Scotland for ratification.

3 Other Information

- ◆ Applicant's Agent: Wilson Design Associates
- ◆ Council Area/Ward: 65 Fernhill
- ◆ Policy Reference(s): Cambuslang/Rutherglen Local Plan 2002
Policy RES9 – Residential Land Use
Policy SLP6 – Development Control General
Policy ENV8 – Management of Natural and Built Heritage
ENV1 – Tree Protection and Management

- ◆ Representation(s):
 ▶ 1 Objection Letter

◆ Consultation(s):

Scottish Civic Trust

AHSS

Historic Scotland

Planning Application Report

1 Application Site

- 1.1 Close to the southern edge of Cathkin, Rutherglen, surrounded by housing on all sides, the application site extends to 1.66 hectares or thereby, and contains, centrally positioned within the site, Cathkin House, a Category B Listed Building which is presently used as a nursing home for the elderly. The house itself was originally built in 1799, and since then has been the subject of a number of extensions. Nevertheless, it is of classical design and appearance, principally 2 storeys with a slate pitched roof, and due to it being built on a slope, it has a full basement storey at the rear (north elevation).
- 1.2 The site itself is not level there being a large lawn area to the front of the house which is relatively level whilst the rear (north half of site) is downward sloping, in some areas quite steep. This northern half is unmaintained/overgrown grassland, which throughout has a number of mature trees.
- 1.3 Vehicular access to the site is from the eastern end of Menteith Drive, part of a late 1980's built housing estate. This vehicular access leads to a large tarmacadam forecourt in front of the house, from which there is a "service" track which runs around the property. This service track also provides vehicular access to a neighbouring house immediately to the north west of the site.
- 1.4 Surrounding the site, there is a modern residential development to the east which has been completed within the last three years (consent 99/0217), whilst to the south and west there are modern houses approximately 20 years old. To the north however, there is the 1950's/1960's Cathkin housing development where a number of properties have recently been demolished as part of the "Cathkin Ahead" regeneration programme. These houses sit at a level much lower than Cathkin House such that the Listed Building has commanding views over the Glasgow Conurbation.
- 1.5 The use of Cathkin House as a nursing home has resulted in many modern internal alterations/conversions presumably prior to the property being listed for its architectural merit in 1971. As a result, the interior character in many places has been compromised.
- 1.6 The trees within the site are protected by a Tree Preservation Order. Prior to the erection of the housing development to the east of the site, a private driveway linked the site with Cathkin Road although due to its condition it was only used by pedestrian traffic.

2 Proposal(s)

- 2.1 It is now proposed to extend Cathkin House and convert it to 8 flats, along with the erection of 9 detached dwellinghouses in the northern and eastern sections of the site. In detail the conversion and extension to Cathkin House will involve:
 - ♦ The erection of an extension at the western side of the house. This extension, in relative terms, is small, and will result in a garden flat, with attic accommodation (a small traditionally designed dormer) being provided. This "one and a half" storey extension will be at basement level, will be finished with a slate roof, timber sash and case windows and have a wet dash render. Other traditional materials

will be used e.g. zinc ridging, cast iron gutters/downpipes, and due to its basement level, it will be barely visible from the front of the property.

- ◆ The erection of a slate covered roof over an existing flat roofed part of the house.
- ◆ The replacement on an external “like for like” basis of the existing pitched roof (the applicant has submitted a report from a rot specialist confirming that the roof structure is seriously affected by rot and infestation by the furniture beetle.) New dormer windows, similar in appearance to existing ones, are also proposed for the new roof, four in the rear and an additional two at the front.
- ◆ External alterations including new window openings, doors, stonework repairs etc. and at the rear of the proposed garden flat extension, the regrading of the existing ground level.
- ◆ Significant internal alterations – removal of timber stud partitions, formation of new door openings etc. whilst retaining, in their original form, the principal rooms and staircase. In addition, confirmation has also been received that all cornicing, paneled doors, skirting and other original features will be restored/retained.

- 2.2 In addition to the above, the whole house will be rewired and replumbed, new high performance sash and case timber windows will be installed, structural repairs will be undertaken, damp proof courses inserted etc., all of which will comply with the current technical standards of the Building (Scotland) Regulations.
- 2.3 With regards to the proposed residential development within the grounds of the house, this will consist of nine detached two storey villas (5 different house types with 3 or 4 bedrooms) of traditional style/appearance. In this respect, the houses will have slate roofs, rendered walls with stone features, and they have been positioned within the site in order that their impact on the setting of Cathkin House is minimized (at the rear and side furthest away from the vehicular entrance) whilst taking account of the existing mature trees and the site’s topography. A limited number of trees, mainly small/young ones will be affected.
- 2.4 The existing access to the site from Menteith Drive will be retained. The internal access arrangements however will be revised, with a properly engineered road, with footpaths and traffic calming, being provided around Cathkin House whilst retaining access to the neighbouring property. In terms of parking, each house will have off street parking whilst communal parking (16 spaces) for the flats will be provided at the front of the listed building.
- 2.5 In support of the proposal the applicant has advised that he has undertaken successfully a similar development to another Listed Building in a neighbouring Local Authority. In addition further supporting information, including the timber report referred to earlier and cost appraisals from the developers Quantity Surveyor have been lodged to demonstrate and justify the development as proposed.
- 2.6 During the processing of this application, the number of proposed flats within Cathkin House has been reduced from 16 to 8 with subsequent design and layout changes.

- 2.7 An application for planning consent (CR/04/0113) in respect of the proposed extension and conversion of Cathkin House to eight flats and the erection of nine dwellinghouses within its grounds has also been lodged and is considered in a separate report to Committee.

3 Background

3.1 Local Plan Status

- 3.1.1 The application site is within a Residential Land Use Area in terms of the adopted Cambuslang/Rutherglen Local Plan 2002, the applicable Policy being RES9. In addition, Policy SLP6 – Development Control General; Policy ENV8 – Management of Natural and Built Heritage and ENV1 – Tree Protection and Management are appropriate.

- 3.2 Relevant Government Advice/Policy: Historic Scotland's Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas (1998) is of prime importance. In general terms, the areas of relevance are:

- ◆ Development affecting the setting: The guidance emphasizes that at all times, the listed building should remain the focus of its setting, and as a result, development within the curtilage should always be regarded as affecting the setting. In addition, in urban areas, the restriction or obstruction of views from or to the listed building or development that rises above is discouraged.
- ◆ Additions and Extensions: An extension should always play a subordinate role and should not detract from the principal elevation(s). When the extension is designed to 'match' the original property, it must do so in all respects. In some circumstances, a well designed modern structure may be better as it will not read as part of the original building. A lot however will depend upon the site, the scale and form of the existing building and the design of the proposal.
- ◆ Interiors: All interior work is part of the listing and therefore the nature of the proposed work must be carefully assessed. Whenever possible principal rooms and internal features should be retained.

- 3.3 There have been no previous planning applications within the last five years.

4 Consultation(s)

- 4.1 **Historic Scotland** - Proposals are still significantly interventionist in terms of the character and setting of the listed building. The total replacement of the roof seems excessive and the repair specification, i.e. new high performance sash and case timber windows should only be considered if the existing windows are beyond repair. Further detail/clarification of existing features such as fireplaces etc. is required. The overall bulk of the new extension has been reduced to a satisfactory level.

With respect to the proposed houses, the impact on the setting of the new building could be detrimental. If this element is to be supported, it must be justified as "enabling development" which is necessary to secure the long term future of the Listed Building. A financial appraisal detailing and justifying this is therefore necessary. Unless this can be provided to the Council's satisfaction, it is recommended that consent be refused.

Response: Since the submission of this application and the accompanying planning application (CR/04/0113) various meetings have taken place with Historic Scotland and the applicants agent. As a result, the proposed conversion of the house has been altered significantly in that the number of units has been reduced from 16 to 8. Internally, therefore the layout and form of the proposal has been amended in a positive manner. I accept, however, that details regarding the retention and restoration of all original features still requires absolute clarification, and therefore, should consent be issued a condition to this effect will be necessary. Associated with the conversion, the proposed extension has been redesigned in order that its bulk has been reduced to an acceptable level. Two areas of contention remain however, namely, the replacement of the original roof and the proposed nine houses in the grounds of the property.

The roof of the existing property is very poor. There is water ingress, vegetation growing and the roof space has been abandoned a number of years ago such that former plaster walls have crumbled and large sheets of plastic collect water. The dormers are uninhabited (except for pigeons and other birds) and a report by timber specialists has highlighted significant rot and disease. Technically it is possible to repair the identified problems but given the limited extent of the non-intrusive survey that was undertaken, it is more that likely that further decay will be found. In addition, given the end use of the proposal (residential) and the specification stipulation and requirements of the National House Builders Council in terms of their house purchase guarantee, the replacement of the roof on an external like for like basis does not appear unreasonable, especially as it will ensure the longevity of the roof whilst retaining its external character and appearance. Indeed, I am aware that other listed buildings whose roof has been totally replaced without adverse effect on the properties listed status, character or appearance.

With regards to the proposed houses, I fully accept that in normal circumstances, such development would be resisted. The applicant however has submitted detailed financial appraisals demonstrating that the proposed houses are necessary in order to fund the development costs associated with the conversion of Cathkin House whilst generating a reasonable developers return. In this connection it is unquestionable that the development costs associated with the Listed Building are greater than 'normal', e.g. slate roof, cast iron gutters etc. and that the expected returns from the various flats/houses (sale price) are set by the housing market. From the figures supplied, I have no reason to question the various calculations which clearly demonstrate that an element of cross-funding is required especially since the number of flats proposed has been reduced from 16 to 8.

On the basis that an element of cross-funding is required to retain and secure Cathkin House, it is vital to ensure that the impact of the houses are within acceptable limits. In this respect, their location within the grounds of the property reflects previous advice given by Historic Scotland, being to the rear and eastern side of the house. At this location, they are furthest from the main elevation and vehicular entrance, thereby reducing their visual impact/presence. In addition, the retention of mature trees should help further, the integration of old and "new".

The main setting of the house, (the remaining front lawn area) will primarily remain undeveloped. Furthermore, the design of the houses, and the proposed external materials, will, in my opinion, complement the house rather than detract from it. Overall, therefore having taken all factors into account especially the pressing need

to retain a listed building, a balanced judgment has to be reached. On this occasion, I am persuaded that the impact of the proposed housing is within acceptable limits and is justified, both in listed building and enabling development terms to secure and retain a viable future for the Listed Building.

- 4.2 **Scottish Civic Trust** - Believes that the proposed residential accommodation would be an appropriate re-use of the building. Nevertheless, objects strongly as the proposal is over ambitious in respect of the number of flats and houses proposed. In addition, the size of the extension is extremely insensitive. Internally, the oval principal room should not be altered.

Response: Since the comments were received, the number of flats proposed have been reduced from 16 to 8, as has the size (and impact) of the proposed extension. Internally the principle rooms have been retained in their present form and therefore a number of the concerns highlighted by the Civic Trust have been addressed. The number of proposed detached houses however still remain, this being necessary in order to justify the overall development (paragraph 4.1 above)

- 4.3 **Architectural Heritage Society for Scotland** - Similar comments as the Scottish Civic Trust with additional emphasis on the proposal “destroying” the setting of Cathkin House.

Response: As stated in the above response, the proposal has been amended to generally accord with the comments received. The housing development in the grounds of the house is still an integral part of the overall development, and for the reasons previously detailed, (location within site, design, relationship with front of house, topography etc.) I believe that on balance, the houses can be justified in order to secure the future of the Listed Building.

5 Representation(s)

- 5.1 Statutory neighbour notification undertaken. In addition, given the listed status of Cathkin House, the application, along with the associated Listed Building submission (CR/04/0114) was advertised in the local newspaper (Reformer), the Edinburgh Gazette and a site notice displayed. Following this publicity, one letter has been received, acknowledging no objection in principle to the development, but expressing the following:

(a) Potential damage to existing roads due to heavy traffic associated with the development.

Response: Although the access road to the site (Menteith Drive) is residential in nature it is a public road and therefore any vehicle that is taxed, insured and with an MOT (if required) can use this carriageway. In addition, the road has been constructed to an appropriate standard which should be able to accommodate all types of traffic, including vehicles associated with the proposed development.

(b) Possible damage to houses from traffic.

Response: Should any damage occur, and I consider it unlikely, this would be a private matter between the parties involved.

(c) Request an extension to the existing 20 mph speed restriction beside Cathkin Primary School.

Response: The existing 20 mph speed restriction is there to slow vehicle speeds on the approach to the school given the likelihood of children being present. Unfortunately this cannot be extended to include surrounding residential streets.

6 Assessment and Conclusions

- 6.1 This Listed Building Submission has to be assessed in the context of Local Plan Policy ENV8 – Management of National and Built Heritage and Historic Scotland's Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas: Of particular importance in this respect are the details associated with the conversion/re-use of the property and the impact of the proposed nine houses on the setting of Cathkin House.
- 6.2 In terms of the conversion of the property from a nursing home to residential this, in principle, is acceptable. It is the detailed matters associated with the conversion that are important, and following discussions with the agent, I am confident that all internal features and architectural merit will be retained, and where appropriate enhanced. Indeed, conditions to ensure this would be a prerequisite of any consent that is issued.
- 6.3 The total replacement of the roof is one detailed aspect that has raised concerns. Its repair and retention does in most circumstances, merit support, but on this occasion the existing condition of the roof timbers (rot etc.) and the need to provide the future occupiers of the flats with a 'guaranteed' roof structure is also important. A balanced judgment between these competing requirements is therefore necessary, and as the external appearance of the roof will not be affected or compromised in any way, then I am persuaded that the loss of the original roof timbers can be accommodated without irreversible damage to the listed building.
- 6.4 The proposed development in the grounds of the listed building is also an issue, this element of the proposal being viewed negatively by the consultees. In this regard I accept that in line with the guidance contained in Historic Scotland's memorandum, any development within the ground/curtilage of a listed building does affect its setting. It is however the extent and degree of this impact that is important and whether or not it is to a material extent sufficient to justify the withholding of listed building consent.
- 6.5 Policy ENV8 of the Local Plan (Management of Natural and Built Heritage) seeks, amongst other matters, to safeguard architectural or historic buildings and their setting. In addition, the policy aims to promote listed buildings at risk, and in this connection, I believe that it is better to secure a viable, economic and sustainable future for listed buildings prior to them becoming vacant
- 6.6 It has been demonstrated that the proposed houses will cross fund/subsidise the conversion/extension of Cathkin House. The details supplied do indicate that the number of units proposed is the minimum necessary to secure the future of the listed building taking into account a reasonable return to the developer given the risk involved. The financial appraisals are sound, and I accept that a degree of new build is required to secure a sustainable future for Cathkin House. The extent, location and impact of such new build is therefore critical to this application.

- 6.7 The location of the proposed houses is, in my opinion, the most appropriate and environmentally sensitive. The proposed houses, in terms of design, will compliment the Listed Building and they are located such that their impact on the house, when viewed from the site's entrance, will be reduced. Indeed, the location of the proposed residential houses was previously advanced by Historic Scotland.
- 6.8 Overall, I am of the view that this proposal is now in a form that can be justified and merits support in order to provide a viable, stable future for a Listed Building. The degree of new build operations is significant, but on balance, I accept that this is necessary and the cumulative impact on Cathkin House will be within acceptable limits. With appropriate conditions, I am confident that the proposal will enhance the character of the listed building and therefore I would recommend that consent be issued.

Iain Urquhart
Executive Director (Enterprise Resources)

4 July 2005

Previous References

- ◆ None.

List of Background Papers

- ▶ Application Form
- ▶ Application Plans
- ▶ Site notice dated 20/05/2004
- ▶ Cambuslang/Rutherglen Local Plan 2002
- ▶ Memorandum of Guidance, Listed Building and Conservation Areas, Historic Scotland
- ▶ Press advertisement – The Edinburgh Gazette
- ▶ Press advertisement – The Rutherglen Reformer
- ▶ Faxes dated 15/06/2004 and 09/07/2004 to Wilson Design Associates
- ▶ Letter dated 24/06/2004 from Wilson Design Associates
- ▶ Letter dated 21/09/2004 from Historic Scotland
- ▶ Letters dated 15/01/2004 and 19/11/2004 to Wilson Design Associates
- ▶ Fax dated 18/01/2005 to Wilson Design Associates
- ▶ Letter dated 05/12/2004 from Wilson Design Associates
- ▶ Letter dated 02/02/2005 to Historic Scotland
- ▶ Letter dated 28/04/2005 from Historic Scotland
- ▶ Letters dated 25/02/2005 and 24/05/2005 from Wilson Design Associates
- ▶ Letter dated 24/02/2005 from Ventrolla
- ▶ Letter dated 25/02/2005 from Richardson and Starling
- ▶ Associated Planning Application CR/04/0113
- ▶ Consultations
 - AHSS 13/05/04
 - Civic Trust 08/07/04
 - Historic Scotland 11/06/04

► Representations

Representation from: Menteith Residents Association, 30 Menteith Place,
Rutherglen G73 5RQ, DATED 10/06/04

Contact for Further Information

If you would like to inspect the background papers or want further information, please contact:-

Steven Clark, Planning Officer, Royal Burgh House, 380 King Street, Rutherglen

Ext: 5140 (Tel : 0141 613 5140)

E-mail: Enterprise.cam-ruth@southlanarkshire.gov.uk

CONDITIONS

- 1 That the development hereby permitted shall be started within five years of the date of this permission.
- 2 That the development shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the plans hereby approved and no change to the design or external finishes shall take place without the prior written approval of the Council as Planning Authority.
- 3 That before any development commences on site or before any materials are ordered or brought to the site, details and samples of all materials to be used as external finishes on the development shall be submitted to and approved by the Council as Planning Authority.
- 4 That the materials to be used for any external repairs to the walls of the listed building shall match in colour, texture and appearance the existing external finish of the property to the satisfaction of the Council as Planning Authority and prior to any such repairs being undertaken samples of the stone etc to be used for repair work shall be lodged for the written approval of the Council as Planning Authority.
- 5 That prior to any work commencing on site further drawings at a scale of 1:10 detailing the existing dormer windows that will be removed and the proposed replacements/additions shall be lodged for the written approval of the Council as Planning Authority.
- 6 That within one month of the date of this consent further drawings at a scale of 1:10 shall be lodged for the written approval of the Council as Planning Authority detailing the proposed timber sash and case windows to be installed and no work shall commence on site until consent for these drawings or such other details that may be acceptable to the said Authority has been issued.
- 7 That within one month of the date of this consent further drawings indicating all existing original features within the listed building that are to be retained, including staircases, fireplaces, panelling, doors, door cases and door furniture, dadoes and other decorative woodwork, plaster work, cornices etc shall be lodged for the written approval of the Council as Planning Authority and no work shall commence on site until these details have been approved in writing by the said Authority.
- 8 That within one month of the date of this consent a full and comprehensive photographic record of all rooms, corridors etc with the Listed Building along with an accompanying schedule cross referencing each photograph to its location within the building and identifying all the internal features that are to be retained as detailed in condition No. 7 above, shall be submitted to the Council as Planning Authority for their retention and written approval.
- 9 That within one month of the date of this consent further drawings indicating the position of central heating flues and ventilation grilles etc shall be lodged for the written consent of the Council as Planning Authority and thereafter the approved details shall be implemented on site to the satisfaction of the said Authority.

REASONS

- 1 To accord with the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.
- 2 In the interests of amenity and in order to retain effective planning control.
- 3 In the interests of amenity and in order to retain effective planning control.
- 4 To ensure satisfactory integration of the proposed extension with the existing building both in terms of design and materials.
- 5 To safeguard the character and appearance of the Listed Building.
- 6 To safeguard the character and appearance of the Listed Building.
- 7 To safeguard the character and appearance of the Listed Building.
- 8 To safeguard the character and appearance of the Listed Building.
- 9 To safeguard the character and appearance of the Listed Building.

For information only

For information only

