

Report

6

Report to:	Planning Committee
Date of Meeting:	31 October 2006
Report by:	Executive Director (Enterprise Resources)

Application No	EK/05/0692
Planning Proposal:	Alterations to Crossbasket House to Form Ten Dwellings; Part Demolition, Replacement, Alteration and Extension of former Coach House Building to Form Five Dwellings; Erection of Five houses and Associated Works within Crossbasket House. (Listed Building Consent)

1 Summary Application Information

- Application Type : Listed Building Application
- Applicant : Langvale Ltd
- Location : Crossbasket House
Stonemeadow Road
High Blantyre

2 Recommendation(s)

2.1 The Committee is asked to approve the following recommendation(s):-

- (1) Refuse Listed Building Consent (For the reasons stated)

2.2 Other Actions/Notes

The Planning Committee has delegated powers to determine this application.

3 Other Information

- ◆ Applicant's Agent: Keppie Planning Ltd.
- ◆ Council Area/Ward: 14 Long Calderwood
- ◆ Policy Reference(s): **East Kilbride and District Local Plan (Adopted)**
Policies ENV1 and SLP1 – Greenbelt,
ENV6 – Protection of the Natural and Built Environment,
ENV10 – Listed Buildings,
DC1 and SLP6 – Development Control General.
- South Lanarkshire Local Plan (Finalised Plan)(August 2006)**
Policies STRAT3 – The Greenbelt and Urban Settlements In The Green Belt Policy.
CRE1- Housing in the Countryside
ENV4 – Protection of the Natural and Built

Environment,
ENV23 – Listed Buildings,
ENV27 – Historic Gardens and Designed
Landscapes,
DM1 – Development Management.

- ◆ Representation(s):
 - ▶ 1 Objection Letters

- ◆ Consultation(s):

AHSS

Historic Scotland

Scottish Civic Trust

Garden History Society for Scotland

Planning Application Report

1 Application Site

- 1.1 The application site relates to Crossbasket House and its landscaped grounds which extend to 5.54 hectares of designated Greenbelt located on the north eastern edge of East Kilbride, bordering High Blantyre.
- 1.2 The site is bounded by woodland and farmland to the north and east and by Stoneymeadow Road to the south and west. The site is well screened by mature periphery woodland, and particularly to the north and south by predominantly large conifers.
- 1.3 Crossbasket House, sometimes referred to as Crossbasket Castle is a Category 'A' Listed building. It is the predominant feature within the application site with a former coach house and outbuildings lying northeast of the main house. The house is accessed via a sweeping tree-lined driveway from Stoneymeadow Road. A traditional cottage, known as Main Lodge, is located at the driveway entrance and a further single storey dwelling known as Foveran is located to the east of the main house, and is accessed via the main driveway. The main house overlooks ornamental mature planting and sloping lawns to the south.
- 1.4 Immediately to the west of the house flows the Rotten Calder within a deep wooded gorge and General's Bridge which is located to the south west of the main house. A dam, waterfalls, footbridges and pathways exist within the gorge linking to the main house. This informal garden and walkway is generally overgrown and in disrepair.

2 Proposal(s)

- 2.1 The applicant proposes to refurbish and convert the main Listed Building to form ten dwellings, part demolish, replace and extend the stables area to provide five dwellings and construct five new detached houses within the grounds of Crossbasket House. More specifically the proposals are as follows.
 - a) The original tower, or 'keep' of Crossbasket House, dating from around the sixteenth century to be converted to a self-contained dwelling.
 - b) The main Victorian element of Crossbasket House, with the exception of the east wing to be converted to eight flats. The principal alterations within this area are the extension of the main stair to basement level and the removal of a rear service stair in its entirety.
 - c) The east wing of the main house to be converted to one self-contained dwelling.

Virtually no alteration to the exterior of the building is proposed except for repairs to the fabric.

- d) The former coach house and outbuildings to be re-developed to form five dwellings. This would partially utilise the existing building footprint which would also be extended. It is proposed to hard landscape the coach house yard area to the south to form a communal car parking area. The houses would have external finishes of stone, render and slate to reflect the existing finishes of Crossbasket House.

- e) The construction of five detached houses within the grounds.
- Three of these dwellings are proposed along the southern periphery of the application site to be screened from the main house by existing trees and shrubs and additional planting of trees. These dwellings are to be accessed by a new separate vehicular access from Stoneymeadow Road which would also link to the main sweeping driveway via an internal road cutting through the landscaped grounds.
 - Two additional dwellings to be constructed to the north of the Category 'B' Listed General's Bridge accessed via a shared vehicular access onto Stoneymeadow Road directly south of the existing Glen Rose Cottage.

All five dwellings are to be of a one and a half storey design containing four bedrooms (some with ensuite facilities), livingroom, lounge, dining room, kitchen and bathroom accommodation. Double garages are also proposed. External finishes to be used, to harmonise with the whole development, include render, slate roofs and timber (sash and case) windows.

- 2.2 It should be noted that whilst the applicant has applied for listed building consent covering the same proposal as the related planning application, only the works to Crossbasket House and the buildings attached to the garden wall in the coach house area require formal Listed Building Consent.

3 Background

3.1 Local Plan Status

The proposal can be assessed against the policies contained within both the adopted East Kilbride and District Local Plan and the South Lanarkshire Local Plan (Finalised Plan). The relevant policies in this instance are: ENV6 which has regard to the character and amenity of the built and natural environment and seek to safeguard designated listed or other sites of conservation or ecological interest or value, ENV10 which has regard to amenity and character of Listed Buildings and DC1 and SLP6 which have regard to design. South Lanarkshire Local Plan (Finalised Plan) Policies ENV23 and ENV27 relate to Listed Buildings and, in this case the attached historic garden and designed landscape. A full discussion of the proposal against these policies is contained in Section 6 of this report.

4 Consultation(s)

4.1 Historic Scotland (HS) – Commented as follows.

- a) Proposals for the new residential units in the grounds at Crossbasket house will affect the setting of the A-listed building and there is a formal requirement for the Council to consult Historic Scotland under the terms of the General Development Procedure Order (GDPO).
Response: The proposal was advertised as Development affecting the Setting of a Listed Building. Historic Scotland have been involved in extensive discussion with the Council and the developer regarding the various elements of the proposal.
- b) In terms of enabling development HS have concerns about the scale and location of the new-build which is in the Greenbelt. Enabling development should be the minimum necessary to unlock the development potential of the listed building and enable its restoration. It should be located and designed to have minimum impact upon the architectural and historic interest, character and setting of the A-listed building.

Response: I would agree that the scale and location of development within the curtilage of the listed building which is designated Greenbelt is concerning and would appear to be beyond the acceptable parameters of enabling development.

- c) In particular the three new units on the elevated garden ground to the south of the house will be highly visible from the house and will therefore have a serious negative impact on the character and setting of the house.

Response: Despite detailed supporting information by the developer's landscape architect attempting to justify that the new-build can be effectively screened from the house, I would agree with HS that the new units would have a detrimental impact on the character and setting of the listed building.

- d) HS express doubts whether any development would be appropriate in the immediate vicinity of the listed building as its curtilage would seem to be appropriate to its scale and importance as a building of architectural and historic interest.

Response: I would agree that the new build is inappropriate in the immediate vicinity of the listed building and its curtilage.

- e) HS recommend that the stable block proposals are revised to reduce the scale and loss of historic fabric. The former stable block and its garden wall are listed at Category A as they are physically attached to the house and contain historic fabric. Any development should be located to the northeast of the wall.

Response: Further discussion with the developer has resulted in the submission of revised plans in respect of the stable block area. This addresses the breaching of the wall albeit that a lot of the historic fabric is likely to be lost as a result of the units' re-arrangement.

- f) HS generally accept the proposed conversion of Crossbasket House to ten flatted units subject to amendments to avoid unnecessary removal of original fabric and fittings. The amendments requested by Historic Scotland would include using existing door openings rather than punching new openings through walls and amending Flat 4 in order to retain the recessed buffet and mirror in the original dining room.

Response: The applicant is aware of Historic Scotland's comments in respect of these alterations. No amended drawings have been submitted to take account of these comments.

- g) In respect of Building Control requirements, HS intimate that no details have been submitted in respect of venting, plumbing etc within the kitchen and bathroom areas. Such detail must be shown to ensure that they don't have an adverse effect on the character of the building.

Response: As Crossbasket House is an A listed building, both Historic Scotland and the Council would wish to see these details prior to granting listed building consent. Again, the applicant is aware of Historic Scotland's comments in respect of these works. No amended drawings have been submitted to take account of these comments.

- 4.2 **Garden History Society in Scotland** – have no objection in principle to the proposal, welcoming the work to Crossbasket House. They recommend that proposed screening of the new-build reflects the established species of the grounds.

In addition they recommend that a management plan is compiled for the estate to ensure continuity of the overall designed landscape structure.

Response: Noted, however Historic Scotland's Memorandum of Guidance requires the Council to take account of developments which affect the historic garden and designed landscape which forms Crossbasket House estate. I would consider that the works to create new build dwellings would significantly and adversely impact on this resource.

- 4.3 **Scottish Civic Trust** -have no objections in terms of the conversion of the main house to ten flats subject to some minor changes. They do not agree with the conversion of the coach house area breaching the garden wall and consider that the three new-build dwellings located to the front of the house would have a detrimental effect on the setting of Crossbasket House given that they would be in full view of its principal elevations. Furthermore, the most westerly house would entail substantial tree felling and the new access road would have a negative impact on the grounds. They accept the principle of the two dwellings on the other side of the river subject to consideration of Greenbelt status.

Response: Subject to some changes it is considered that the conversion of the main house to ten flats is acceptable to both the Council and Historic Scotland. Further it is considered that the redevelopment of the coach house buildings can be sensitively designed to address the majority of Historic Scotland's concerns. Revised plans have been received indicating all of the coach house development to the north of the stone wall. In terms of the new build, through the recent submission of revised plans, one unit has been dropped reducing the number to four. Notwithstanding this the Council and Historic Scotland still have fundamental concerns about any new build within the grounds given the Greenbelt status and the effect on the character and setting of the 'A' Listed Building.

- 4.4 **Architectural Heritage Society Scotland (AHSS)** – find the proposals generally acceptable.

Response: Noted.

5 Representation(s)

- 5.1 Following neighbour notification and the advertising of the proposal in the East Kilbride News newspaper and the Edinburgh Gazette, one letter of representation was received. The point raised is summarised below:

- a) **The area is Greenbelt and building there would be contrary to the development plan.**

Response: The site is located within the Greenbelt and the new build elements of the proposal are contrary to both adopted and emerging Greenbelt policy. The proposal was advertised as potentially contrary to the development plan.

6 Assessment and Conclusions

- 6.1 The applicant has applied for listed building consent for the formation of ten flatted dwellings through conversion of the 'A' Listed Crossbasket House, the redevelopment of the former stable block/coach house to form five dwellings in a courtyard arrangement and the erection of five detached villas in the estate grounds of Crossbasket Estate. Through the recent submission of revised plans the most easterly detached dwelling has been omitted thus consideration currently relates to four new-build properties. The current sweeping access from Stoney Meadow Road

would be upgraded to serve the main house and courtyard development with the formation of a new access serving two of the new build dwellings and linking to the existing driveway across the landscaped grounds. The other two proposed detached dwellings located to the west would have a shared access onto Stoney Meadow Road just north of the General's Bridge which is a Category 'B' listed structure. Listed Building Consent is only required for the works to the A Listed Building and attached coach house.

- 6.2 The proposal requires to be assessed against the following policies contained in the adopted East Kilbride and District Local Plan. Policy ENV6 – Protection of the Natural and Built Environment states that the Council opposes development which would have an adverse impact on the character and amenity of the natural and built environment and in doing so the Council shall seek to safeguard designated, listed or other sites of conservation or ecological interest. Policy ENV10 – Listed Buildings seeks to ensure the continued conservation and enhancement of listed buildings and presumes against development that will be likely to have an adverse impact on the amenity and character of the building. Whilst the conversion of Crossbasket House to flats is generally welcome and the principle of the development of the former stable block to residential units is acceptable, there are elements of the alterations which require alteration or further details to be submitted and considered by both the Council and Historic Scotland. Whilst not requiring listed building consent, I am also concerned about the development of the large detached dwellings within the grounds. In my opinion, this will detrimentally affect the character and setting of the house. Policies DC1 and SLP6 – Development Control General state that all development should be compatible in terms of scale, massing and external materials to adjacent buildings and the surrounding area. Despite the applicant endeavouring to create detached dwellings which will not impact on the listed building the overriding issue in this instance is the concern that the development does affect the setting of Crossbasket House. The proposed courtyard development is likely to be acceptable provided that there is careful use of high quality external finishes on a previously developed site.
- 6.3 The proposal also requires to be assessed against the South Lanarkshire Local Plan (Finalised Plan). The relevant policies within this document are ENV4 – Protection of the Natural and Built Environment, ENV23 – Listed Buildings, ENV27 – Historic Gardens and Designed Landscapes and DM1 – Development Management.
- 6.4 Policy ENV4 – Protection of the Natural and Built Environment states that the Council will assess all development proposals in terms of their effect on the character and amenity of the natural and built environment. In doing so, the Council will seek to safeguard designated and non-designated sites including Category 'A' listed buildings and their settings. Again, although not requiring formal listed building consent, development within the grounds of Crossbasket House would be contrary to this policy. Policy ENV23 - Listed Buildings states that the proposal should preserve the building and its setting and the scale of the development should be appropriate to the character and appearance of the listed building and its setting. As detailed above, further details and amendments are required regarding the conversion of Crossbasket House to form ten flats. Policy ENV27 seeks to protect historic and designed landscapes. Councils must consult Historic Scotland and SNH on any proposal affecting these resources. Both consultees raise concerns regarding the new build development within the grounds given the potential to affect the character and setting of Crossbasket House which is a historic garden and designed landscape specifically relating to an 'A' listed building. Policy DM1-

Development Management Policy states that the proposal should take account of the local context and built form and should be compatible with adjacent buildings in terms of scale, massing, design, external finishes and impact on amenity.

- 6.6 Of fundamental importance are the concerns raised by Historic Scotland with regard to the detail of the conversion works. Crossbasket House is an A listed building and the listing covers the internal fittings and fixtures as well as the exterior. I have no objections in principle to the conversion of Crossbasket House and welcome the proposed repairs to the exterior of the building however it is essential that any works to the building minimise the loss or damage of original features. The applicants are aware of Historic Scotland's comments and have not taken any steps to address these concerns. I am reluctant to approve a listed building consent without having considered all the details and amendments to the building. For these reasons I would recommend that listed building consent is refused.

7 Reasons for Decision

71. The applicant's have failed to provide amended drawings showing sufficient detail and alterations to the original proposal to allow the conversion of Crossbasket House to be fully and favourably considered by the Council and Historic Scotland.

Iain Urquhart
Executive Director (Enterprise Resources)

17 October 2006

Previous References

- ◆ None

List of Background Papers

- ▶ Application Form
- ▶ Application Plans

- ▶ Consultations
 - Scottish Civic Trust 29/12/06
 - Historic Scotland 19/12/05
 - AHSS 21/12/05
 - Garden History Society in Scotland 23/01/06

- ▶ Representations
 - Representation from : J.E Allan, 94 Franklin Place, Westwood, East Kilbride, G75 8LS, DATED 12/12/05

Contact for Further Information

If you would like to inspect the background papers or want further information, please contact:-

Maud McIntyre, Planning Officer, Civic Centre
Ext. 6385 (Tel :01355 806385)
E-mail: Enterprise.ek@southlanarkshire.gov.uk

Listed Building Application

PAPER APART – APPLICATION NUMBER : EK/05/0692

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- 1 That insufficient detail has been lodged showing all alterations, internal and external, which take account of Historic Scotland's comments and allow full consideration of the proposed alterations to a Category 'A' Listed Building.
- 2 By virtue of the design of the alterations within Crossbasket House, the proposal is contrary to Policy ENV10 - Listed Buildings of the East Kilbride and District Local Plan(adopted October 2003) in that it would remove or damage important, original features of a Category 'A' Listed Building.

For information only

For information only

