

Report to: Date of Report: Report by:	Cambuslang and Rutherglen Area Committee 13 March 2018 Executive Director (Community and Enterprise Resources)

Application NoCR/17/0173Planning Proposal:Removal of Existing Rear Door and Window and Stone Butt to Form<br/>Bi-folding Doors on Existing 'B' Listed Flatted Dwelling (Listed<br/>Building Consent)

## **1** Summary Application Information

- Application Type : Listed Building Application
- Applicant :
- Mr S MacGregor
- Location : 76A Blairbeth Road Burnside
  - Rutherglen G73 4JA

#### Recommendation(s)

## 2.1 The Committee is asked to approve the following recommendation(s):-

(1) Refuse Listed Building Consent – for reasons stated

## 2.2 Other Actions/Notes

(1) The Area Committee has delegated powers to determine this application

#### **3** Other Information

- Applicant's Agent: Colin Crawford
- Council Area/Ward: 11 Rutherglen South
- Policy Reference(s): South Lanarkshire Local Development Plan

(adopted 2015) Policy 4 - Development Management and Placemaking

Policy 15 - Natural and Historic Environment

#### Natural and Historic Environment, Supplementary Guidance (2015) NHE3 - Listed buildings

- Representation(s):
  - 0 Objection Letters
  - 0 Support Letters

- 1 Comment Letter
- Consultation(s):

Historic Environment Scotland (HES)

## 1 Application Site

1.1 This application relates to a ground floor flat at 76A Blairbeth Road in Rutherglen. The property forms part of the ground floor of the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, stylised Greek revival Blairbeth Terrace that was listed as a Category 'B' listed building on 23 March 1992. The site is located within an established residential area.

## 2 Proposal

2.1 The proposal is for the removal of the existing rear door and window, cutting away the surrounding stone wall to form an opening to install aluminum bi-folding doors leading to an existing garden courtyard.

## 3 Background

## 3.1 Local Plan Status

- 3.1.1 Within the adopted South Lanarkshire Local Development Plan, Policy 4 Development Management and Placemaking states that development proposals should take account of the local context and built form and should ensure that there is no significant adverse impact on built heritage.
- 3.1.2 Policy 15 Natural and Historic Environment is also relevant. This policy emphasises that all development proposals will be assessed in terms of their effect on the character and amenity of the natural and built environment. In particular the policy states that development which would affect a listed building will only be permitted where there is no significant adverse impact on the building.
- 3.1.3 Policy NHE3 Listed Buildings states that development affecting a listed building should seek to preserve the building and its setting, and any special features that it has. The layout, design, siting and use of any materials shall be sensitive to, and respect the character and appearance of the listed building and its setting. Any proposals for repairs, alterations and extensions to listed buildings shall demonstrate a sound knowledge and understanding of the building, and demonstrate a full awareness of its cultural significance and all phases of its development.

## 3.2 Relevant Government Advice/Policy

- 3.2.1 Scottish Planning Policy (SPP) recognises the importance of the historic environment as a key part of Scotland's cultural heritage. Alterations and extensions to listed buildings should be managed to protect their special interest while enabling them to remain in active use. The layout, design, materials, scale, siting and use of any development which will affect a listed building or its setting should be appropriate to its character, appearance and setting. However, in some cases the importance of the heritage asset is such that change may be difficult or may not be possible. Decisions should be based on a clear understanding of the importance of the heritage assets.
- 3.2.2 The Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement (2016) (HESPS) charges the planning authority to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the listed building, or its setting, or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.
- 3.2.3 Historic Environment Scotland provides guidance notes on developments affecting Listed Buildings. The relevant document in this instance is Managing Change in the Historic Environment Guidance External Walls (published Oct. 2010), 4.5 New Openings. This document states that the formation of a new opening in a wall needs to be considered in light of the overall composition of the wall and assessed as to whether or not it would be consistent with the existing design. Care should be taken to

ensure that the cumulative effect of new openings does not harm the special interest of the building.

3.2.4 SPP, the HESPS and the Managing Change in the Historic Environment guidance note published by Historic Environment Scotland should be taken into account by planning authorities when determining applications for development which may affect the historic environment.

#### 4.1 <u>Planning History</u>

4.1 An associated, detailed planning application has been received for this proposal (CR/17/0207). That application is also on the agenda for this Area Committee meeting with a recommendation of refusal.

## 5. Consultation(s)

5.1 <u>Historic Environment Scotland (HES)</u> – advise that this wing of the Blairbeth Terrace is a prominent multi-faced wing and is carefully designed with the same high quality finish and Greek revival detailing as the main block. They advise that of particular note is the bowed window which is located immediately adjacent to the location of the proposed bi-fold doors. Their view is that the opening up of a ground floor door and window to create a bi-fold door would adversely impact the special interest and character of this considered composition, and their preference is for this intervention to be avoided. They explain that Planning Authorities are expected to treat HES comments as a material consideration, and this advice should be taken into account in the decision making process. **Response**: Noted.

#### 6 Representation(s)

- 6.1 The application was advertised in the Edinburgh Gazette and Rutherglen Reformer.
- 6.2 As a result of this publicity, 1 letter of comment was received highlighting that the building had been incorrectly described as a 'C' Listed Building on the original application form and the publicity. The description of the application was subsequently rectified and an amended advertisement was carried out.

#### 7 Assessment and Conclusions

- 7.1 The applicant seeks Listed Building Consent for the removal of an existing rear door and window and stone butt to form aluminum bi-folding patio doors. The aluminium doors would be finished with a black coating. The unique architectural and historic interest of the building has been recognised by Historic Environment Scotland and is reflected in its category 'B' listing. The main determining issue in assessing this proposal is compliance with local and national planning policy and in particular its impact on the character and appearance of the listed building.
- 7.2 Policy 4 Development Management and Placemaking states that development proposals should take account of the local context and built form and should ensure that there is no significant adverse impact on built heritage. Policy 15 Natural and Historic Environment states that all development proposals will be assessed in terms of their effect on the character and amenity of the natural and built environment. In particular the policy states that development which would affect a listed building will only be permitted where there is no significant adverse impact on the building. Policy NHE3 Listed Buildings seeks to ensure that the layout, design, siting and use of any materials shall be sensitive to, and respects the character and appearance of, the

listed building and its setting. Any proposals for repairs, alterations and extensions to listed buildings shall demonstrate a sound knowledge and understanding of the building, and demonstrate a full awareness of its cultural significance and all phases of its development.

- 7.3 The proposed alteration is considered to alter significantly the character of the building on this considered elevation and the window alignment with the floors above will be lost with this modern intervention. Cutting away the existing fabric of the building will result in a permanent structural modification. The rear courtyard is currently accessed by the existing door on this elevation and the proposal will provide the same function whilst substantially altering the character of this elevation. It is the combination of the stylised Greek revival details and features on this later 19th century terrace which merits this building its category 'B' Listing which is of regional importance. While the works may be considered relatively minor on an unlisted property, it is the accumulation and precedent of small changes that degrade the integrity and character of the Listed Building as a whole, which ultimately defeats the purpose of their protection. The proposal is therefore considered to conflict with Policy 4, 15 and NHE3 of the adopted South Lanarkshire Local Development Plan.
- 7.4 The SPP, HESPS and Historic Environment Scotland guidance notes all direct local authorities to manage change to listed buildings whilst protecting the building's special interest. The proposal is not considered to comply with the relevant national guidance and Historic Environment Scotland have advised that the proposal will have an adverse impact on the special interest and character of the building.
- 7.5 In light of the above, it is recommended that the listed building application is refused.

#### 8 Reason for Decision

8.1 The proposal fails to comply with Policy 4, 15 and NHE3 of the adopted South Lanarkshire Local Development Plan and the associated supplementary guidance in that it would adversely impact on the character and appearance of the listed building.

#### Michael McGlynn Executive Director (Community and Enterprise Resources)

#### 27 February 2018

#### Previous References

• CR/17/0207

# List of Background Papers

- Application Form
- Application Plans
- South Lanarkshire Local Development Plan 2015 (adopted)
- Consultations Historic Environment Scotland 03/10/2017
- Representations Representation from : A Duncan, 3 Blairbeth Terrace, Rutherglen, G73 4JB, DATED 10/11/2017

#### **Contact for Further Information**

If you would like to inspect the background papers or want further information, please contact:-

Evelyn-Ann Wilson, Planning Officer, Montrose House, 154 Montrose Crescent, Hamilton Ext 5059 (Tel : 01698 455059)

E-mail: evelyn-ann.wilson@southlanarkshire.gov.uk

#### PAPER APART – APPLICATION NUMBER : CR/17/0173

#### **REASONS FOR REFUSAL**

- 1 That the proposal is contrary to Policy 15: Natural and Historic Environment of the South Lanarkshire Local Development Plan (2015) as the proposal does not enhance the conservation value of the site, and does not respect the character and appearance of the listed building or its setting.
- 2 The proposal is contrary to Policy 4: Development Management of the South Lanarkshire Local Development Plan (2015) as the proposal would have an adverse impact on the local built heritage.
- 3 The proposal is contrary to Policy NHE3 Listed Buildings of the South Lanarkshire Local Development Plan Natural and Historic Environment Supplementary Guidance 9 as the alteration does not preserve the building and features of special architectural interest.

#### CR/17/0173

## Planning and Building Standards

76A Blairbeth Road, Rutherglen

Scale: 1: 1250

